

## Butterfly Argument Checklist

My name: \_\_\_\_\_

My reviewer's name: \_\_\_\_\_

**Instructions:** Share your graphic organizer with another person at your table. They will share theirs with you. Read the following requirements for each section. Then, read their claim, evidence, analysis/reasoning, and next steps section. After each section, mark off if they met the requirements and give them a score. If you have comments for improvement, please share them with the student. Comments need to be constructive. That is, the comments are helpful.

Points	Claim
1	The claim is short and to the point. It does not include statements such as “I think,” “I claim,” or “I believe.”
1	The claim clearly tells the reader an answer to the question.

\_\_\_\_\_ / 2 points

**Good claim (2 points):** *Students who eat chocolate during a test earn higher math test scores.*

**Bad claim (1 point):** *I claim that students who eat chocolate during a test earn a higher math test score.*

Points	Evidence
3	Numerical evidence is included for all four colors.
1	The evidence is stated scientifically and does not use dramatic language.
-1	The evidence is not explained; the evidence is only stated.

**Good evidence (5 points):** *The average test score of students who ate chocolate was 95% as compared to an average score of 83% for students who did not eat the chocolate.*

**Bad evidence (0 points):** *The average test score of the students was way better than the dismal, sad, and horrifying score of the students who did not eat the chocolate. This shows how my claim is true.*

\_\_\_\_\_ / 4 points

*Continued on next page.*

Points	Analysis and Reasoning
1	A statement is made that describes how the evidence is connected to the claim.
1	An explanatory hypothesis is offered that explains the finding. This may turn out to be false, but it is a plausible and testable idea. It is not a prediction.

\_\_\_\_\_ / 2 points

**Good A/R (2 points):** *The evidence shows the students who ate chocolate scored higher. This tells me there must be some impact from the chocolate on the student's test ability. I hypothesize that the chocolate helps the students remember information.*

**Bad A/R (0 points):** *The evidence is important to my claim. I think that if students eat more chocolate, then their scores will go even higher!*

Points	Next Steps/What we could do better
1	A statement is made that offers a criticism of the study. The statement is explained as to why it hurt the study.
1	An explanation is offered as to how to overcome this criticism.

\_\_\_\_\_ / 2 points

**Good Next Steps (2 points):** *One limitation of my study is that I only tested this on 10 students. I'm not sure if these ten students are already good or bad at math. I could fix this by doing this again and making sure I have an equal number of students who are good and bad at science.*

**Bad A/R (0 points):** *My study had problems and that makes me wonder if my answer is correct. Next time I will do a better job.*

**Total Score:** \_\_\_\_\_ / 10

In the space below offer comments and questions to the writer to help them improve their argument. Here are examples of good and bad feedback. Remember, feedback is constructive and helpful, not vague or hurtful.

**Good feedback:** Your hypothesis is a prediction because it says what you think is going to happen. What do you think is the cause of the outcome? The answer to this is your hypothesis.

**Bad feedback:** Your argument is good but make it better.

**Additional comments/questions for the writer:**